C	ase 1:03-cv-050/1-GBD-SN	Document 329-16	Filed 01/24/14 Page	e 1 or /
	Ex	hibit	K	

H

```
1
     16N4TERC
 1
     UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 1
     SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
 2
     -----x
 2
 3
     IN RE: TERRORIST ATTACKS
 3
     ON SEPTEMBER 11, 2001
                                            03MDL1570(GBD)(FM)
 4
 4
 5
 5
                                            June 23, 2011
 6
                                            11:35 a.m.
 6
 7
     Before:
 7
 8
                             HON. FRANK MAAS
 8
 9
                                            Magistrate Judge
9
10
                              APPEARANCES
10
     ANDERSON KILL & OLICK
11
11
          Attorneys for O'Neill Plaintiffs and PECs
12 JERRY S. GOLDMAN
12
13 COZEN O'CONNOR
13
          Attorneys for Federal Insurance Plaintiffs and PECs
14
    SEAN P. CARTER
14
     J. SCOTT TARBUTTON
15
15 MOTLEY RICE
16
          Attorneys for Burnett Plaintiffs and PECs
16
     ROBERT T. HAEFELE
17
17
     CLIFFORD CHANCE
18
          Attorneys for Defendant Dubai Islamic Bank
18
     BY: RONI BERGOFFEN (via telephone)
19
19
     McMAHON & ASSOCIATES
          Attorneys for Defendants IIRO, MWL and Wa'el Jelaidan
20
20
     BY: MARTIN McMAHON (via telephone)
21
21
     STEVEN BARENTZEN (via telephone)
22
          Attorney for Defendant Jamal Barzinji
22
23
24
25
                    SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.
```

16N4TERC

2.3

THE COURT: Let me just interrupt. I understand part of the difficulty is that you have not been to the kingdom. I am not suggesting that you need to invest your own money in the case. Quite the opposite; I think that privately retained attorneys are entitled to be paid, and I have never kept in a case an attorney who was not getting paid who wished to exit a case.

But whether it's because of Saudi regulations or whatever, documents were not produced on a schedule which is consistent with my order which was that these 8 narrow categories were to be produced within 30 days, I think 30 days of April 12. I am pretty sure it was as of April 12. Even it was April 26, we are still more than a month beyond the deadline for the 8 narrow categories.

So it seems to me, and you are telling me that after the conference rather than shortly before the conference, you are going to be getting back to Mr. Carter, which basically means there is no way to know what the outcome of that would be today. So I guess I somewhat share plaintiffs' frustration. One thing that your clients ought to be concerned about is that I can't worry about issues like Saudi approvals for attorney fees.

What inevitably may happen in this case is that if responsive documents are not produced, and Mr. Carter and his colleagues are able to show that the documents exist and should SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.

16N4TERC

2.3

be produced, some of the tenor of what they said in the prior conferences suggests to me that they may have specimens of documents from whatever sources that enable them to show that there are categories of reports that exist, which at least as of now have not been produced. If they make a sufficiently persuasive showing, your clients may be faced with the prospect that I issue case-dispositive sanctions.

So, I will let you finish talking but I just wanted you to understand my concerns and where we collectively may all be headed. Go on.

MR. McMAHON: I appreciate that, your Honor. You have always being struck me as being a very level-headed guy and you are trying to satisfy the plaintiffs' needs and you are cognizant of the fact that we are dealing with a foreign country. What my point is that we have produced everything that was called for in terms of the 8 categories for both MWL and IIRO-SA and we now have that format. I am going to send that to Mr. Carter in about an hour or so. I am waiting on our translator to tell me some other things, but we can certainly get that to him.

That is our position that we have complied. I apologize. It was not timely in terms of if you set this down for 30 days. Mr. al Rahdi is just super overworked. He can't get the resources he needs to do all sorts of stuff. He's been killing himself. He has produced a ton of things. I have sent SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.

16N4TERC

2.3

court issued a subsequent order on April 27, directing the IIRO to produce documents relating to other unrelated issues, distinct from the 8 categories. Those included records relating to Mohammed Jamal Khalifa, another individual named Wa'el Jelaidan, and the director named al Mujil.

Since the April 27 order was issued there has been absolutely no production relative to any of those issues. So there has been a focus on a few discrete aspects of the 8 categories. We don't think that that is complete. There has been nothing as to the other order.

Adding to the problems, Mr. McMahon suggested there was a conciliatory tone. What there wasn't was any outreach to us in advance of any of the expirations of these deadlines at all to let us know that there was going to be a problem, to let us know that they were not going to be able to comply with the court's order. It's all after the fact and only after we invest the time and effort to come before the court again on an issue that really should have been put to bed.

THE COURT: What I am inclined to do is to put this over to the July 12 or 13 conference. I think I have made my position clear which is that if a persuasive showing can be made that MWL and IIRO have not fully complied with the rulings that I made on April 12 and April 26, those organizations may be facing a more formal motion that I would entertain which if my recommendation were to be accepted by Judge Daniels might SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.

16N4TERC

2.3

lead to the entry of default judgments against those organizations. By the same token, if you are not getting paid and move to withdraw on another route, they could end up in the same position.

So I am inclined to put this off because there is not much point in my simply saying you really have to comply with orders that I last time and the time before said you really have to comply with. But really the burden is it seems to me on your clients, Mr. McMahon, to establish that they have complied, putting aside questions of timeliness of the compliance.

I don't think I said it before, but as far as I am concerned anything that is produced by anybody needs to be Bates-stamped because it's difficult enough that we are dealing with documents in Arabic and there may be translations down the road, if we have piles of documents that are not Bates-stamped, this is rapidly going to spin even more out of control than it may be now.

MR. CARTER: Your Honor, we have a double problem with regard to Bates-stamping as far as the IIRO is concerned. There were documents produced without Bates stamps. Then there was another production which repeated Bates stamps that were used in an earlier production with regard to different documents. So for instance, I directed Mr. Haefele to a particular Bates stamp the other day and he was looking at a SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.

23 16N4TERC 1 period after 1992. MR. McMAHON: How can it be? He was in jail; he was 3 under arrest. 4 MR. CARTER: He was briefly detained in the United 5 States; he was not in jail throughout that period of time. 6 THE COURT: One thing that Mr. McMahon had suggested 7 was that the person you are relying on to review the documents, 8 or I guess the indices, have a discussion with the person who 9 the defendants are using for the same purpose and I guess I 10 don't see much harm in that. Why should that not occur? 11 MR. CARTER: There's a whole group of people who need 12 to be used to analyze this information. The analysis of 13 information in this case requires a rather unique set of 14 skills. It's not really translating; it's having substantive

knowledge regarding particular activities, particular

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2.3

24

25

individuals, networks.

THE COURT: I am really focusing, maybe I didn't make it clear, on the indices, the two indices, and how they were generated, what you perceive as the shortcomings, why they perceive them as adequate, and perhaps dealing with some of the issues where you say just the file organization suggests that there must be must be other indices. I guess what I am proposing is that whoever is generating that belief on your side communicate with whoever thinks they have done an adequate job on their side as part of an informal meet and confer to see SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.